

BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENT COURT
I MUA I TE KOOTI TAIAO O AOTEAROA

AT AUCKLAND

UNDER the Resource Management Act 1991

A N D

IN THE MATTER of an appeal under section 174 of the Act

BETWEEN ALL SEASONS PROPERTIES LIMITED

(ENV - 2024 - AKL -)

Appellant

WAKA KOTAHİ NEW ZEALAND TRANSPORT AGENCY

Respondent

(Continued next page)

NOTICE OF APPEAL UNDER SECTION 174 OF THE ACT
ON BEHALF OF ALL SEASONS PROPERTIES LIMITED

12 JULY 2024

Counsel instructed:
Bronwyn Carruthers KC
Shortland Chambers
PO Box 4338
Auckland 1140
P: 021 685 809
E: bc@shortlandchambers.co.nz

NOTICE OF APPEAL TO THE ENVIRONMENT COURT

**TO: THE REGISTRAR
ENVIRONMENT COURT
AUCKLAND**

1. **ALL SEASONS PROPERTIES LIMITED** appeals against a decision of the Respondent to accept in part (**Decision**) the Auckland Council's recommendation (**Recommendation**) in respect of:
 - a. The Notice of Requirement to authorise the construction, operation and maintenance of an alternative state highway and associated infrastructure between State Highway 16 near Foster Road and State Highway 16 at Brigham Creek Interchange (**NOR S1 ASH**).
 - b. The Notice of Requirement to authorise the construction, operation and maintenance of a rapid transit corridor and associated activities between Matua Road, Huapai and Brigham Creek Interchange (**NOR S3 RTC**).
2. The Appellant made submissions on the whole of both NOR S1 ASH and NOR S3 RTC.
3. The Appellant received notice of the Decision on 20 June 2024.
4. The Decision was made by the Respondent.
5. The Appellant appeals the parts of the Decision relating to:
 - a. The location and extent of NOR S1 ASH as it relates to the Brigham Creek Interchange;
 - b. The location and extent of NOR S3 RTC as it relates to the Brigham Creek Interchange and/or the Appellant's landholding at 186 Fred Taylor Drive and 194 Fred Taylor Drive;
 - c. The rejection of the Recommendation versions of Conditions 2A, 3, and 11; and
 - d. The lapse date.
6. The Appellant is not a trade competitor for the purposes of section 308D of the Resource Management Act 1991 (**Act**).

7. The reasons for the Appeal are because:
 - a. The NORs will not promote the sustainable management of natural and physical resources.
 - b. When read together, the NORs seek to designate the entirety of the Appellant's land at both 186 Fred Taylor Drive and 194 Fred Taylor Drive.
 - c. The NORs will generate significant adverse effects on the environment, including but not limited to a significant blight on the Appellant's land.
 - d. The NORs will significantly constrain the ability of the Future Urban zoned land to be developed and will thwart the Appellant's intentions to create a well-functioning urban environment in an efficient and effective manner.
 - e. The NORs conflict with the objectives and policies of the Auckland Unitary Plan, including but not limited to Objectives B2.2.1(1) and B3.3.1(1) and Policies B3.3.2(1)-(4).
 - f. The Respondent has failed to give adequate consideration to alternative locations and designs of the Brigham Creek Interchange and related Rapid Transit Corridor that would reduce the severity of the impact on the Appellant and the adverse effects; and
 - g. The extent of the designation for the Brigham Creek Interchange and the Rapid Transit Corridor are not reasonably necessary for achieving the Respondent's objectives.

8. The Appellant seeks the following relief:
 - a. Amend the location and design of the Brigham Creek Interchange and associated Rapid Transit Corridor to avoid the Appellant's land.
 - b. Amend Conditions 2A, 3, and 11 to reflect the Recommendation.
 - c. Reduce the lapse period to 5 years.
 - d. Or, in the alternative:

- i. Order the Respondent to acquire the Appellant's landholdings; or
 - ii. Refuse NOR S1 ASH and NOR S3 RTC.
 - e. Such further or other orders, relief, or consequential amendments that are necessary or appropriate to respond to the grounds of appeal; and
 - f. Costs of and incidental to the Appeal.
9. The following documents are attached to this Appeal:
- a. A copy of the Appellant's submissions on the NORs (**Attachments 1A – 1D**).
 - b. A copy of the Recommendation (**Attachment 2**).
 - c. A copy of the Decision (**Attachment 3**).
 - d. A list of the names and addresses of those who have been served with a copy of this Appeal (**Attachment 4**).

ALL SEASONS PROPERTIES LIMITED, by its counsel:



Signature:	B S Carruthers
Date:	12 July 2024
Address for Service:	Bronwyn Carruthers KC Shortland Chambers PO Box 4338 Shortland Street Auckland 1140
Telephone:	(021) 685 809
Email:	bc@shortlandchambers.co.nz
TO:	Registrar, Environment Court, Auckland
AND TO:	Those persons listed in Attachment 4

Advice to recipients of copy of Notice of Appeal

How to become a party to proceedings

If you wish to become a party to the appeal, you must,—

- (a) within 15 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, lodge a notice of your wish to be a party to the proceedings (in [form 33](#)) with the Environment Court and serve copies of your notice on the relevant local authority and the appellant; and
- (b) within 20 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, serve copies of your notice on all other parties.

You may apply to the Environment Court under [section 281](#) of the Resource Management Act 1991 for a waiver of the above timing requirements (see [form 38](#)).

Your right to be a party to the proceedings in the court may be limited by the trade competition provisions in [section 274\(1\)](#) and [Part 11A](#) of the Resource Management Act 1991.

Advice

If you have any questions about this notice, contact the Environment Court in Auckland, Wellington or Christchurch.

ATTACHMENT 1
COPY OF APPELLANT'S SUBMISSIONS

ATTACHMENT 2
COPY OF THE RECOMMENDATION

**ATTACHMENT 3
COPY OF THE DECISION**

ATTACHMENT 4**LIST OF PERSONS TO BE SERVED WITH A COPY OF THIS APPEAL****Waka Kotahi – New Zealand Transport Agency:**

Megan Exton megan.exton@supportinggrowth.nz

Bruce Hawkins environmentalplanning@nzta.govt.nz

Auckland Council

Auckland Council
Manager Regulatory Litigation
Legal and Risk
Private Bag 92300
Auckland 1142

Submitters on Notices of Requirement as per attached tables

NOR S1 ASH Submitters

Kingsley Seol

Peiping Liu and Tony Wu

CJS NZ Limited

Morris Chang

Member of Parliament for Kaipara ki Mahurangi
Christopher Penk

GH Atchison PM Atchison

John Martin Alexander

Emily McGowan

Samuel L Cooper

Geoffrey Sinclair

Spark New Zealand Trading Limited (Spark)

Te Kawerau a Maki (Te Kawerau Iwi Tiaki Trust)

Merchant Timber Ltd

Future-Kumei Incorporated

Robyn Emm

Nickolas Salter & Donna Young

Dave Watt

Colin Emm

Lynette Carter

Clement Lim

Peter Edward Clark and Diane Margaret Clark

Phelan Pirrie

Chao Family Trust

Rob Mihaljevich

Address for Service

king_seol@hotmail.com

maryhng@hotmail.com

scott@urbanplan.co.nz

morris.chang502@gmail.com

chris.penkmp@parliament.govt.nz

gatchison05@gmail.com

john.alexander@mbrands.co.nz

mcgowan_emily@hotmail.com

slcoopz@gmail.com

geoffsinclair88@gmail.com

chris@incite.co.nz

edward.ashby@tekawerau.iwi.nz

koheroa@gmail.com

office@francisbrosLtd.co.nz

cinderela666@hotmail.com

donna@salter.net.nz

davew.apl@gmail.com

colin.emm@ccep.com

l.carter@outlook.co.nz

alienball@yahoo.com

petermosquita01@gmail.com

pirrie@gmail.com

dchao.realmart@gmail.com

strand@outlook.co.nz

Qihui Michael Zhou	mkvivi@hotmail.com
Country Living Realty	graham.mcintyre@mikepero.com
Huapai Truck Painters Ltd.	info@truckpainters.co.nz
The Way Family Trust	clive.way@xtra.co.nz
	PO Box 287 Kumeu Auckland 0841
Anne Smith	
Steve Clark	scaw@xtra.co.nz
Briar Dunn	briardunn2003@yahoo.co.nz
Dean Forster	dean.forster@xtra.co.nz
Lendich Construction Limited	burnette@thepc.co.nz
Body Corporates number 98706 (90a, 90B, 90c and 90D Main Rd Kumeu)	molly.whittington7@gmail.com
Liam Alexander Josef Kiely	liamkielynz@gmail.com
Katie Richards	sk.richards@xtra.co.nz
Chohan Lanka Dissanayake	05home.chohan@gmail.com
Andrew Kinzett	ajjkinzett@gmail.com
Huihui Chen	mkcrz@hotmail.com
Bruce and Lisbeth Norton	bandl.norton@xtra.co.nz
Lien Wang	dakara0415@gmail.com
Jurene Andrew	jurenesu@gmail.com
Russell Williams	arusellw.nz@gmail.com
Beverley Speedy	bevspeedy@xtra.co.nz
Vicki Jones	mvdk@xtra.co.nz
John Richard Baker Phillipa Clare Baker Gwillim Family Trust	jandpbaker@xtra.co.nz
Kumeu Shopping Village Combined Owners' Committee: Kumeu Medical Centre & Body Corporates 98706, 97519, 96480, & 109614	kiran@kayjaitax.co.nz

Laureen Reeve	laureen.reeve@one.nz
Colin and Lenore Read	lenoreread@xtra.co.nz
Jim Hickling	jifitopa@xtra.co.nz
Stephanie Reilly	steph@loganarchitects.co.nz
Mary Connelly and James Scully	mconnelly@xtra.co.nz
Ms Yulan Xu and Ms Shuang He	yulawyers@gmail.com
Kumeu Dental Surgery Ltd	paul@kumeudental.co.nz
Paul Jared Kennedy	paul@chapmanv.com
Anna Barnett	annamcpbee@gmail.com
Peter Lawrence Gifkins	kenza@xtra.co.nz
Roseanne Kalley Dassler	roseannedassler@hotmail.com
Simply Events Holdings Ltd	ruthc@simplyevents.co.nz
Victoria Sydney Facoory	sandparkstables@hotmail.co.nz
Holly Southernwood	holly@figg.nz
ComDev Ltd	jan@comdev.co.nz
Atlas Concrete Limited	david.haines@hainesplanning.co.nz
Tiger Aspell	tasp006@hotmail.com
Ray Chong and Judy Chong	paulinesho@gmail.com
Price Properties Limited	joan.forret@harkness.co.nz
Margaret Anne White	margaretwhite140@gmail.com
Firstgas Ltd	pam.unkovich@firstgas.co.nz
Simon Papa	simon.papa2@gmail.com
Alesana and Stacie Levi	leviplumbing@outlook.com
Topland New Zealand Limited	liam@topland.co.nz
Dianne Mary Kamuhemu	dkamuhemu@gmail.com
Muyi Zeng and Bihui Zhao	michael@campbellbrown.co.nz

KiwiRail Holdings Limited	Pam.butler@kiwirail.co.nz
Bradford Dibble	B.Dibble@xtra.co.nz
Anca Joicey	anca@kumeudental.co.nz
Arlene Ross	arlene.ross2610@gmail.com
W&P ENTERPRISES LIMITED	jwsp@xtra.co.nz
Jose Alberto Cosio and Deborah Naire Cosio	joe@cosio.co.nz
Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	PlannerNR@heritage.org.nz
Steve Clark & Anne Smith	scaw@xtra.co.nz
Ross Roderick Spence and Adrienne Mayo Spence	peter.smith@smithpartners.co.nz
John Russell Falconer and Karen Anderson	j.anderson@civicchambers.co.nz
Watercare Services Limited	mark.bishop@water.co.nz
Victoria Sydney Facoory	sandparkstables@hotmail.co.nz
Natalya Ujdur	owen@greengroup.co.nz
Telecommunications Submitters	chris@incite.co.nz
NZRPG	cbarbour@nzrpg.co.nz
Kāinga Ora Homes and Communities	developmentplanning@kaingaora.govt.nz

NOR S3 RTC Submitters**Address for Service**

Peiping Liu and Tony Wu	maryhng@hotmail.com
CJS NZ Limited	scott@urbanplan.co.nz
Morris Chang	morris.chang502@gmail.com
Christopher Penk Member of Parliament for Kaipara ki Mahurangi	chris.penkmp@parliament.govt.nz
GH Atchison PM Atchison	gatchison05@gmail.com
John Martin Alexander	john.alexander@mmbrands.co.nz
Steve Morpeth	steve@griptec.co.nz
Emily McGowan	mcgowan_emily@hotmail.com
Christine Lynda Brown	craigandchris123@hotmail.com
Spark New Zealand Trading Limited (Spark)	chris@incite.co.nz
Merchant Timber Ltd	koheroa@gmail.com
Nicole Matthews	matthewsnic@gmail.com
Robyn Emm	cinderela666@hotmail.com
Colin Emm	colin.emm@ccep.com
Future-Kumei Incorporated	office@francisbrosltd.co.nz
Huapai Truck Painters Ltd	info@truckpainters.co.nz
The Way Family Trust	clive.way@xtra.co.nz
Lance Williams	lancekw@xtra.co.nz
Michael Land	hermes@actrix.co.nz
Ministry of Education	gemma.hayes@education.govt.nz
Theresa smith	theresasmith@hotmail.co.nz
Jonathan and Wendi Williamson	jon.williamson@wwla.kiwi
Nickolas Salter and Donna Young	donna@salter.net.nz
Chao Family Trust	dchao.realmart@gmai.com

West Coast Rangers Football and Sports Club Incorporated	chair@westcoastrangers.co.nz
Kumeū Cricket Club	chair@kumeucricket.co.nz
Phelan Pirrie	pirrie@gmail.com
Qihui Michael Zhou	mkvivi@hotmail.com
Country Living Realty Limited	graham.mcintyre@mikepero.com
Mate Tolj	beth.mate@xtra.co.nz
Ben Xu	xuben@sina.com
Anthony T Osman	osman@farmside.co.nz
Anne Smith	PO Box 287, Kumeu Auckland 0841
Briar Dunn	briardunn2003@yahoo.co.nz
Steve Clark	scaw@xtra.co.nz
TechSavvy Ltd	andrewfpennington@gmail.com
Louise Baker	bakermouse@yahoo.co.uk
Kumeu Central Limited (KCL)	burnette@thepc.co.nz
Lauren Windross	lauren.windross@gmail.com
Mohammad Ali Muttaqi	mmut014@aucklanduni.ac.nz
Lendich Construction Limited	burnette@thepc.co.nz
Steve Clark and Anee Smith	scaw@xtra.co.nz
Katie Richards	sk.richards@xtra.co.nz
Andrew Kinzett	ajjkinzett@gmail.com
Huihui Chen	mkcrz@hotmail.com
Hot Property Trust	paul@harveyshomes.co.nz
Lien Wang	dakara0415@gmail.com
Jurene Andrew	jurenesu@gmail.com
Russell Williams	arussellw.nz@gmail.com

Shona Grundy	shona@grundy.co.nz
Yu Wang	ppbb6606@gmail.com
Bruce and Lisbeth Norton	bandl.norton@xtra.co.nz
Holly Southernwood	holly@figg.nz
Kumeu Medical Centre	william.ferguson@kumeumedical.co.nz
Jane Langford	austin@novocon.co.nz
Kumeu Shopping Village Combined Owners' Committee: Kumeu Medical Centre & Body Corporates 98706, 97519, 96480, & 109614	kiran@kayjaitax.co.nz jamsnow@hotmail.com valavil@xtra.co.nz molly.whittington7@gmail.com
Laureen Reeve	laureen.reeve@one.nz
Mary Connelly and James Scully	mconnelly@xtra.co.nz
Susan McKinnon	suemckinnon01@gmail.com
Jackson Lai	chunhung.lai@hotmail.com
Jim Hickling	jifitopa@xtra.co.nz
Roseanne Dassler	roseannedassler@hotmail.com
Tahua Partners Limited("TPL")	burnette@thepec.co.nz
Anna Barnett	annamcpbee@gmail.com
PETER LAWRENCE GIFKINS	kenza@xtra.co.nz
Shamrock Drive Body corporate	vtlr100@gmail.com
Dean Forster	dean.forster@xtra.co.nz
Peter Edward Clark and Diane Margaret Clark	petermosquita01@gmail.com
Atlas Concrete Limited	david.haines@hainesplanning.co.nz
Michael Davis Family Trust	highreward@xtra.co.nz
Ray Chong and Judy Chong	paulinesho@gmail.com
Price Properties Limited	joan.forret@harkness.co.nz

Ulrich and Fleur Hess	uhess@xtra.co.nz
Simon Papa	simon.papa2@gmail.com
Eileen Spence and David Gillespie	b.espence@outlook.com
Colin and Lenore Read	lenoreread@xtra.co.nz
Dianne Mary Kamuhemu	dkamuhemu@gmail.com
Alesana and Stacie Levi	leviplumbing@outlook.com
KiwiRail Holdings Limited	Pam.butler@kiwirail.co.nz
Morleyvest Limited	ross.morley@remd.co.nz
Pedro's Roast Kumeu Village	yflowe@hotmail.com
Anca Joicey	anca@kumeudental.co.nz
W&P ENTERPRISES LIMITED	jwsp@xtra.co.nz
Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga	PlannerNR@heritage.org.nz
The Walker Family Trust	keren@mhg.co.nz
The Walker Family Trust and Sharon Walker Family Trust	keren@mhg.co.nz
Ross Roderick Spence and Adrienne Mayo Spence	peter.smith@smithpartners.co.nz
John Russell Falconer and Karen Anderson	j.anderson@civicchambers.co.nz
Adrian Bullock	adrianbullock@gmail.com
Watercare Services Limited	mark.bishop@water.co.nz
Victoria Sydney Facoory	sandparkstables@hotmail.co.nz
Bowring Properties Group	mattn@barker.co.nz
T A S Ltd	mattn@barker.co.nz
Telecommunications Submitters	chris@incite.co.nz
Z Energy Limited	stephanie.degroot@minterellison.co.nz
Z Energy Limited	Imogene.jones@minterellison.co.nz

The National Trading Company of New Zealand
Limited

dsadler@ellisgould.co.nz

Christopher McGuire

cjmcguire@xtra.co.nz

NZRPG

cbarbour@nzrpg.co.nz

Kāinga Ora Homes and Communities

developmentplanning@kaingaora.govt.nz

Ms Susan Newnham

sue@sue2.co.nz