

BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENT COURT
I MUA I TE KOOTI TAIAO O AOTEAROA

AT AUCKLAND

UNDER the Resource Management Act 1991

A N D

IN THE MATTER of an appeal under section 174 of the Act

BETWEEN ALL SEASONS PROPERTIES LIMITED

(ENV - 2024 - AKL -)

Appellant

WAKA KOTAHİ NEW ZEALAND TRANSPORT AGENCY

Respondent

(Continued next page)

NOTICE OF APPEAL UNDER SECTION 174 OF THE ACT
ON BEHALF OF ALL SEASONS PROPERTIES LIMITED

12 JULY 2024

Counsel instructed:
Bronwyn Carruthers KC
Shortland Chambers
PO Box 4338
Auckland 1140
P: 021 685 809
E: bc@shortlandchambers.co.nz

NOTICE OF APPEAL TO THE ENVIRONMENT COURT

**TO: THE REGISTRAR
ENVIRONMENT COURT
AUCKLAND**

1. **ALL SEASONS PROPERTIES LIMITED** appeals against a decision of the Respondent to accept in part (**Decision**) the Auckland Council's recommendation (**Recommendation**) in respect of:
 - a. The Notice of Requirement to authorise the construction, operation and maintenance of an alternative state highway and associated infrastructure between State Highway 16 near Foster Road and State Highway 16 at Brigham Creek Interchange (**NOR S1 ASH**).
 - b. The Notice of Requirement to authorise the construction, operation and maintenance of a rapid transit corridor and associated activities between Matua Road, Huapai and Brigham Creek Interchange (**NOR S3 RTC**).
2. The Appellant made submissions on the whole of both NOR S1 ASH and NOR S3 RTC.
3. The Appellant received notice of the Decision on 20 June 2024.
4. The Decision was made by the Respondent.
5. The Appellant appeals the parts of the Decision relating to:
 - a. The location and extent of NOR S1 ASH as it relates to the Brigham Creek Interchange;
 - b. The location and extent of NOR S3 RTC as it relates to the Brigham Creek Interchange and/or the Appellant's landholding at 186 Fred Taylor Drive and 194 Fred Taylor Drive;
 - c. The rejection of the Recommendation versions of Conditions 2A, 3, and 11; and
 - d. The lapse date.
6. The Appellant is not a trade competitor for the purposes of section 308D of the Resource Management Act 1991 (**Act**).

7. The reasons for the Appeal are because:
 - a. The NORs will not promote the sustainable management of natural and physical resources.
 - b. When read together, the NORs seek to designate the entirety of the Appellant's land at both 186 Fred Taylor Drive and 194 Fred Taylor Drive.
 - c. The NORs will generate significant adverse effects on the environment, including but not limited to a significant blight on the Appellant's land.
 - d. The NORs will significantly constrain the ability of the Future Urban zoned land to be developed and will thwart the Appellant's intentions to create a well-functioning urban environment in an efficient and effective manner.
 - e. The NORs conflict with the objectives and policies of the Auckland Unitary Plan, including but not limited to Objectives B2.2.1(1) and B3.3.1(1) and Policies B3.3.2(1)-(4).
 - f. The Respondent has failed to give adequate consideration to alternative locations and designs of the Brigham Creek Interchange and related Rapid Transit Corridor that would reduce the severity of the impact on the Appellant and the adverse effects; and
 - g. The extent of the designation for the Brigham Creek Interchange and the Rapid Transit Corridor are not reasonably necessary for achieving the Respondent's objectives.

8. The Appellant seeks the following relief:
 - a. Amend the location and design of the Brigham Creek Interchange and associated Rapid Transit Corridor to avoid the Appellant's land.
 - b. Amend Conditions 2A, 3, and 11 to reflect the Recommendation.
 - c. Reduce the lapse period to 5 years.
 - d. Or, in the alternative:

- i. Order the Respondent to acquire the Appellant's landholdings; or
 - ii. Refuse NOR S1 ASH and NOR S3 RTC.
 - e. Such further or other orders, relief, or consequential amendments that are necessary or appropriate to respond to the grounds of appeal; and
 - f. Costs of and incidental to the Appeal.
9. The following documents are attached to this Appeal:
- a. A copy of the Appellant's submissions on the NORs (**Attachments 1A – 1D**).
 - b. A copy of the Recommendation (**Attachment 2**).
 - c. A copy of the Decision (**Attachment 3**).
 - d. A list of the names and addresses of those who have been served with a copy of this Appeal (**Attachment 4**).

ALL SEASONS PROPERTIES LIMITED, by its counsel:



Signature:

B S Carruthers

Date:

12 July 2024

Address for Service:

Bronwyn Carruthers KC
Shortland Chambers
PO Box 4338
Shortland Street
Auckland 1140

Telephone:

(021) 685 809

Email:

bc@shortlandchambers.co.nz

TO:

Registrar, Environment Court, Auckland

AND TO:

Those persons listed in Attachment 4

Advice to recipients of copy of Notice of Appeal*How to become a party to proceedings*

If you wish to become a party to the appeal, you must,—

- (a) within 15 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, lodge a notice of your wish to be a party to the proceedings (in [form 33](#)) with the Environment Court and serve copies of your notice on the relevant local authority and the appellant; and
- (b) within 20 working days after the period for lodging a notice of appeal ends, serve copies of your notice on all other parties.

You may apply to the Environment Court under [section 281](#) of the Resource Management Act 1991 for a waiver of the above timing requirements (see [form 38](#)).

Your right to be a party to the proceedings in the court may be limited by the trade competition provisions in [section 274\(1\)](#) and [Part 11A](#) of the Resource Management Act 1991.

Advice

If you have any questions about this notice, contact the Environment Court in Auckland, Wellington or Christchurch.

ATTACHMENT 1
COPY OF APPELLANT'S SUBMISSIONS

ATTACHMENT 2
COPY OF THE RECOMMENDATION

**ATTACHMENT 3
COPY OF THE DECISION**

ATTACHMENT 4**LIST OF PERSONS TO BE SERVED WITH A COPY OF THIS APPEAL****Waka Kotahi – New Zealand Transport Agency:**

Megan Exton megan.exton@supportinggrowth.nz

Bruce Hawkins environmentalplanning@nzta.govt.nz

Auckland Council

Auckland Council
Manager Regulatory Litigation
Legal and Risk
Private Bag 92300
Auckland 1142

Submitters on Notices of Requirement as per attached tables

NOR S1 ASH Submitters

Kingsley Seol

Peiping Liu and Tony Wu

CJS NZ Limited

Morris Chang

Member of Parliament for Kaipara ki Mahurangi
Christopher Penk

GH Atchison PM Atchison

John Martin Alexander

Emily McGowan

Samuel L Cooper

Geoffrey Sinclair

Spark New Zealand Trading Limited (Spark)

Te Kawerau a Maki (Te Kawerau Iwi Tiaki Trust)

Merchant Timber Ltd

Future-Kumei Incorporated

Robyn Emm

Nickolas Salter & Donna Young

Dave Watt

Colin Emm

Lynette Carter

Clement Lim

Peter Edward Clark and Diane Margaret Clark

Phelan Pirrie

Chao Family Trust

Rob Mihaljevich

Address for Service

king_seol@hotmail.com

maryhng@hotmail.com

scott@urbanplan.co.nz

morris.chang502@gmail.com

chris.penkmp@parliament.govt.nz

gatchison05@gmail.com

john.alexander@mbrands.co.nz

mcgowan_emily@hotmail.com

slcoopz@gmail.com

geoffsinclair88@gmail.com

chris@incite.co.nz

edward.ashby@tekawerau.iwi.nz

koheroa@gmail.com

office@francisbrosLtd.co.nz

cinderela666@hotmail.com

donna@salter.net.nz

davew.apl@gmail.com

colin.emm@ccep.com

l.carter@outlook.co.nz

alienball@yahoo.com

petermosquita01@gmail.com

pirrie@gmail.com

dchao.realmart@gmail.com

strand@outlook.co.nz

| | |
|---|--------------------------------------|
| Qihui Michael Zhou | mkvivi@hotmail.com |
| Country Living Realty | graham.mcintyre@mikepero.com |
| Huapai Truck Painters Ltd. | info@truckpainters.co.nz |
| The Way Family Trust | clive.way@xtra.co.nz |
| | PO Box 287 Kumeu Auckland 0841 |
| Anne Smith | |
| Steve Clark | scaw@xtra.co.nz |
| Briar Dunn | briardunn2003@yahoo.co.nz |
| Dean Forster | dean.forster@xtra.co.nz |
| Lendich Construction Limited | burnette@thepc.co.nz |
| Body Corporates number 98706 (90a, 90B, 90c and 90D Main Rd Kumeu) | molly.whittington7@gmail.com |
| Liam Alexander Josef Kiely | liamkielynz@gmail.com |
| Katie Richards | sk.richards@xtra.co.nz |
| Chohan Lanka Dissanayake | 05home.chohan@gmail.com |
| Andrew Kinzett | ajjkinzett@gmail.com |
| Huihui Chen | mkcrz@hotmail.com |
| Bruce and Lisbeth Norton | bandl.norton@xtra.co.nz |
| Lien Wang | dakara0415@gmail.com |
| Jurene Andrew | jurenesu@gmail.com |
| Russell Williams | arusellw.nz@gmail.com |
| Beverley Speedy | bevspeedy@xtra.co.nz |
| Vicki Jones | mvdk@xtra.co.nz |
| John Richard Baker Phillipa Clare Baker Gwillim Family Trust | jandpbaker@xtra.co.nz |
| Kumeu Shopping Village Combined Owners' Committee: Kumeu Medical Centre & Body Corporates 98706, 97519, 96480, & 109614 | kiran@kayjaitax.co.nz |

| | |
|--------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Laureen Reeve | laureen.reeve@one.nz |
| Colin and Lenore Read | lenoreread@xtra.co.nz |
| Jim Hickling | jifitopa@xtra.co.nz |
| Stephanie Reilly | steph@loganarchitects.co.nz |
| Mary Connelly and James Scully | mconnelly@xtra.co.nz |
| Ms Yulan Xu and Ms Shuang He | yulawyers@gmail.com |
| Kumeu Dental Surgery Ltd | paul@kumeudental.co.nz |
| Paul Jared Kennedy | paul@chapmanv.com |
| Anna Barnett | annamcpbee@gmail.com |
| Peter Lawrence Gifkins | kenza@xtra.co.nz |
| Roseanne Kalley Dassler | roseannedassler@hotmail.com |
| Simply Events Holdings Ltd | ruthc@simplyevents.co.nz |
| Victoria Sydney Facoory | sandparkstables@hotmail.co.nz |
| Holly Southernwood | holly@figg.nz |
| ComDev Ltd | jan@comdev.co.nz |
| Atlas Concrete Limited | david.haines@hainesplanning.co.nz |
| Tiger Aspell | tasp006@hotmail.com |
| Ray Chong and Judy Chong | paulinesho@gmail.com |
| Price Properties Limited | joan.forret@harkness.co.nz |
| Margaret Anne White | margaretwhite140@gmail.com |
| Firstgas Ltd | pam.unkovich@firstgas.co.nz |
| Simon Papa | simon.papa2@gmail.com |
| Alesana and Stacie Levi | leviplumbing@outlook.com |
| Topland New Zealand Limited | liam@topland.co.nz |
| Dianne Mary Kamuhemu | dkamuhemu@gmail.com |
| Muyi Zeng and Bihui Zhao | michael@campbellbrown.co.nz |

| | |
|---|---------------------------------------|
| KiwiRail Holdings Limited | Pam.butler@kiwirail.co.nz |
| Bradford Dibble | B.Dibble@xtra.co.nz |
| Anca Joicey | anca@kumeudental.co.nz |
| Arlene Ross | arlene.ross2610@gmail.com |
| W&P ENTERPRISES LIMITED | jwsp@xtra.co.nz |
| Jose Alberto Cosio and Deborah Naire Cosio | joe@cosio.co.nz |
| Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga | PlannerNR@heritage.org.nz |
| Steve Clark & Anne Smith | scaw@xtra.co.nz |
| Ross Roderick Spence and Adrienne Mayo Spence | peter.smith@smithpartners.co.nz |
| John Russell Falconer and Karen Anderson | j.anderson@civicchambers.co.nz |
| Watercare Services Limited | mark.bishop@water.co.nz |
| Victoria Sydney Facoory | sandparkstables@hotmail.co.nz |
| Natalya Ujdur | owen@greengroup.co.nz |
| Telecommunications Submitters | chris@incite.co.nz |
| NZRPG | cbarbour@nzrpg.co.nz |
| Kāinga Ora Homes and Communities | developmentplanning@kaingaora.govt.nz |

NOR S3 RTC Submitters**Address for Service**

| | |
|---|---------------------------------|
| Peiping Liu and Tony Wu | maryhng@hotmail.com |
| CJS NZ Limited | scott@urbanplan.co.nz |
| Morris Chang | morris.chang502@gmail.com |
| Christopher Penk Member of Parliament for Kaipara ki Mahurangi | chris.penkmp@parliament.govt.nz |
| GH Atchison PM Atchison | gatchison05@gmail.com |
| John Martin Alexander | john.alexander@mmbrands.co.nz |
| Steve Morpeth | steve@griptec.co.nz |
| Emily McGowan | mcgowan_emily@hotmail.com |
| Christine Lynda Brown | craigandchris123@hotmail.com |
| Spark New Zealand Trading Limited (Spark) | chris@incite.co.nz |
| Merchant Timber Ltd | koheroa@gmail.com |
| Nicole Matthews | matthewsnic@gmail.com |
| Robyn Emm | cinderela666@hotmail.com |
| Colin Emm | colin.emm@ccep.com |
| Future-Kumei Incorporated | office@francisbrosltd.co.nz |
| Huapai Truck Painters Ltd | info@truckpainters.co.nz |
| The Way Family Trust | clive.way@xtra.co.nz |
| Lance Williams | lancekw@xtra.co.nz |
| Michael Land | hermes@actrix.co.nz |
| Ministry of Education | gemma.hayes@education.govt.nz |
| Theresa smith | theresasmith@hotmail.co.nz |
| Jonathan and Wendi Williamson | jon.williamson@wwla.kiwi |
| Nickolas Salter and Donna Young | donna@salter.net.nz |
| Chao Family Trust | dchao.realmart@gmai.com |

| | |
|--|------------------------------------|
| West Coast Rangers Football and Sports Club Incorporated | chair@westcoastrangers.co.nz |
| Kumeū Cricket Club | chair@kumeucricket.co.nz |
| Phelan Pirrie | pirrie@gmail.com |
| Qihui Michael Zhou | mkvivi@hotmail.com |
| Country Living Realty Limited | graham.mcintyre@mikepero.com |
| Mate Tolj | beth.mate@xtra.co.nz |
| Ben Xu | xuben@sina.com |
| Anthony T Osman | osman@farmside.co.nz |
| Anne Smith | PO Box 287, Kumeu Auckland 0841 |
| Briar Dunn | briardunn2003@yahoo.co.nz |
| Steve Clark | scaw@xtra.co.nz |
| TechSavvy Ltd | andrewfpennington@gmail.com |
| Louise Baker | bakermouse@yahoo.co.uk |
| Kumeu Central Limited (KCL) | burnette@thepc.co.nz |
| Lauren Windross | lauren.windross@gmail.com |
| Mohammad Ali Muttaqi | mmut014@aucklanduni.ac.nz |
| Lendich Construction Limited | burnette@thepc.co.nz |
| Steve Clark and Anee Smith | scaw@xtra.co.nz |
| Katie Richards | sk.richards@xtra.co.nz |
| Andrew Kinzett | ajjkinzett@gmail.com |
| Huihui Chen | mkcrz@hotmail.com |
| Hot Property Trust | paul@harveyshomes.co.nz |
| Lien Wang | dakara0415@gmail.com |
| Jurene Andrew | jurenesu@gmail.com |
| Russell Williams | arussellw.nz@gmail.com |

| | |
|---|--|
| Shona Grundy | shona@grundy.co.nz |
| Yu Wang | ppbb6606@gmail.com |
| Bruce and Lisbeth Norton | bandl.norton@xtra.co.nz |
| Holly Southernwood | holly@figg.nz |
| Kumeu Medical Centre | william.ferguson@kumeumedical.co.nz |
| Jane Langford | austin@novocon.co.nz |
| Kumeu Shopping Village Combined Owners' Committee: Kumeu Medical Centre & Body Corporates 98706, 97519, 96480, & 109614 | kiran@kayjaitax.co.nz jamsnow@hotmail.com valavil@xtra.co.nz molly.whittington7@gmail.com |
| Laureen Reeve | laureen.reeve@one.nz |
| Mary Connelly and James Scully | mconnelly@xtra.co.nz |
| Susan McKinnon | suemckinnon01@gmail.com |
| Jackson Lai | chunhung.lai@hotmail.com |
| Jim Hickling | jifitopa@xtra.co.nz |
| Roseanne Dassler | roseannedassler@hotmail.com |
| Tahua Partners Limited("TPL") | burnette@thepec.co.nz |
| Anna Barnett | annamcpbee@gmail.com |
| PETER LAWRENCE GIFKINS | kenza@xtra.co.nz |
| Shamrock Drive Body corporate | vtlr100@gmail.com |
| Dean Forster | dean.forster@xtra.co.nz |
| Peter Edward Clark and Diane Margaret Clark | petermosquita01@gmail.com |
| Atlas Concrete Limited | david.haines@hainesplanning.co.nz |
| Michael Davis Family Trust | highreward@xtra.co.nz |
| Ray Chong and Judy Chong | paulinesho@gmail.com |
| Price Properties Limited | joan.forret@harkness.co.nz |

| | |
|--|---------------------------------------|
| Ulrich and Fleur Hess | uhess@xtra.co.nz |
| Simon Papa | simon.papa2@gmail.com |
| Eileen Spence and David Gillespie | b.espence@outlook.com |
| Colin and Lenore Read | lenoreread@xtra.co.nz |
| Dianne Mary Kamuhemu | dkamuhemu@gmail.com |
| Alesana and Stacie Levi | leviplumbing@outlook.com |
| KiwiRail Holdings Limited | Pam.butler@kiwirail.co.nz |
| Morleyvest Limited | ross.morley@remd.co.nz |
| Pedro's Roast Kumeu Village | yflowe@hotmail.com |
| Anca Joicey | anca@kumeudental.co.nz |
| W&P ENTERPRISES LIMITED | jwsp@xtra.co.nz |
| Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga | PlannerNR@heritage.org.nz |
| The Walker Family Trust | keren@mhg.co.nz |
| The Walker Family Trust and Sharon Walker Family Trust | keren@mhg.co.nz |
| Ross Roderick Spence and Adrienne Mayo Spence | peter.smith@smithpartners.co.nz |
| John Russell Falconer and Karen Anderson | j.anderson@civicchambers.co.nz |
| Adrian Bullock | adrianbullock@gmail.com |
| Watercare Services Limited | mark.bishop@water.co.nz |
| Victoria Sydney Facoory | sandparkstables@hotmail.co.nz |
| Bowring Properties Group | mattn@barker.co.nz |
| T A S Ltd | mattn@barker.co.nz |
| Telecommunications Submitters | chris@incite.co.nz |
| Z Energy Limited | stephanie.degroot@minterellison.co.nz |
| Z Energy Limited | Imogene.jones@minterellison.co.nz |

The National Trading Company of New Zealand
Limited

dsadler@ellisgould.co.nz

Christopher McGuire

cjmcguire@xtra.co.nz

NZRPG

cbarbour@nzrpg.co.nz

Kāinga Ora Homes and Communities

developmentplanning@kaingaora.govt.nz

Ms Susan Newnham

sue@sue2.co.nz